

Parish:	Burnham Thorpe	
Proposal:	Listed Building Application: Erection of part single, part two storey rear extension and two single storey side extensions with installation of new kitchen, internal alterations, improvements to car park and installation of replacement LPG tank, following demolition of two storage sheds	
Location:	The Lord Nelson Walsingham Road Burnham Thorpe Norfolk	
Applicant:	Greene King	
Case No:	17/01754/LB (Listed Building Application)	
Case Officer:	Mrs P Lynn	Date for Determination: 14 November 2017

Reason for Referral to Planning Committee – The views of the Parish Council are contrary to the Officer Recommendation

Neighbourhood Plan: No

Case Summary

The site is situated on the southern side of Walsingham Road, Burnham Thorpe and consists of a two storey, Grade II listed public house with associated pub garden and parking areas.

The application seeks listed building consent for the erection of a part single, part two storey rear extension and two single storey side extensions with installation of new kitchen and internal alterations.

A corresponding planning application which also included improvements to the car park, creation of additional parking spaces and installation of replacement LPG tank, following the demolition of two storage sheds is also before the Committee for consideration under reference 17/01753/F.

During the course of the application amended plans have been submitted in response to third party comments received.

Key Issues

- Principle of development and impact on the designated heritage asset
- Design, character and appearance
- Other material considerations
- Other material considerations

Recommendation:

APPROVE

THE APPLICATION

This property was listed Grade II under the Planning (Listed Buildings & Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended for its special architectural or historic interest in June 1953 with the statutory entry as follows:-

Public house. C18, some pre-1700 evidence to facade. Colourwashed clunch and flint with brick dressings, red pantiled roof. 2 storey, 2 windows. 2 ground and 2 first floor plate glass sashes with single glazing bar division. Central c.1930 part glazed door under bracketed hipped canopy. Blocked C17 brick dressed window above door, stitching only of C17 openings to one ground and 2 first floor windows. Brick end quoins and dentil eaves cornice, coped parapets with end stacks. East gable lean-to, clunch gable above. Flint with brick dressed rear, brick with tumbling to west gable. Reputedly Captain Nelson Hardy gave dinner here in 1793 when recommissioned on active service as Captain of HMS Agamemnon.

Over time the building has been altered by the addition of the single storey elements to the side and rear. A small barn to the side has also been converted to restaurant space with a new link to the original building.

This application for listed building consent proposes the demolition of two storage sheds followed by the erection of a part single, part two storey rear extension and two single storey side extensions, installation of a new kitchen and internal alterations. Other elements of the proposal such as changes to the car parking are not considerations of this application for listed building consent but are considerations of the corresponding planning application.

The proposal has been amend in response to third party comments received during the course of the application. The plans now show that the scale of the rear extension has been reduced so that the eaves of the two storey part of the extension sit below the existing eaves height and the ridge height is now also below that of the existing building . The external materials have also been altered to break up the massing of the proposed extension and the two storey section will be rendered, the ground floor section will be brick and the toilet extension will be finished in feather edge boards.

SUPPORTING CASE

The application is supported by a Planning, Heritage, Design & Access Statement which is available to read on the application file. The planning elements are dealt with as part of the corresponding planning application but with regard heritage aspects the document describes the building, its history and the current proposals making the following points;-

The significance of the building is mainly considered to rest in the external appearance of the original part of the public house and the form of the three front rooms.

The NPPF makes it clear that heritage assets should ideally be maintained in their original use and that they must be used in a way which is viable. The pub is currently closed and the proposals constitute important improvements which will help to attract a new tenant allowing it to re-open and continue to be used for its original purpose and as a valuable community facility for Burnham Thorpe and a source of local employment.

The proposals have been carefully designed with input from officers to ensure a high quality result and line with the relevant policies the scale, height, massing, materials and layout of

the development respond sensitively and sympathetically to the local setting to ensure a high quality design. The form, detailing and materials of the extension have sought to maintain local character and a high quality environment.

The main part of the proposals is the part single, part two storey rear extension which replaces existing rear extensions. The gable ended extensions complement the scale and form of the original building but can clearly be read separately from it. The glazed elevation onto the garden will add a contemporary touch which will, again, differentiate the old from the new. A traditional palette of materials has been chosen to match the existing pub so that there is no conflict or competition in texture or colour. The internal alterations proposed would not affect the original part of the pub but only remove modern partition walls and fittings.

Policy CS12 recognises the crucial role that the historic and built environment play in delivering environmental quality and well-being. The proposals fully support this by providing extensions which would be complementary, high quality and respectful of the listed status of the pub protecting its architectural and historic interest.

With regard to advice contained within the NPPF the proposed development would lead to less than substantial harm and this harm has been minimised by optimising the proposed layout to fit the site and minimising the loss of historic features. The very limited harm caused by extending the building would be more than outweighed by the benefits of investing in the fabric of the building to allow it to re-open and resume its original use. This constitutes a significant public benefit for Burnham Thorpe and the wider district.

The modest design and sympathetic use of traditional materials would ensure that the proposals would preserve the character and appearance of the conservation area. The scheme of extensions and alterations has been carefully designed, to ensure that the proposals complement the listed building and the conservation area. Traditional materials will be used throughout. Improvements to the storage provision at the site and to the car park will improve the appearance of the wider site.

The proposals have been re-designed to respond to further comments made by officers and will result in significant investment in the public house and help it to re-open to the benefit of the local community.

The proposals would therefore accord with the Development Plan and the provisions of the NPPF

PLANNING HISTORY

17/01753/F: Erection of part single, part two storey rear extension and two single storey side extensions with installation of new kitchen, internal alterations, improvements to car park and installation of replacement LPG tank, following demolition of two storage sheds – Corresponding planning application currently under consideration.

08/02554/LB: Application Permitted: 19/12/08 - Proposed Porch to Front Entrance of Existing Public House - The Lord Nelson, Walsingham Road, Burnham Thorpe;

08/02553/F: Proposed Porch to Front Entrance of Existing Public House – Approved January 2009

2/95/1491/F: Alterations to existing garage to form store – Approved December 1995

2/95/1170/LB: Conversion of barn to form restaurant with link to public house to include ventilation stack over proposed store and removal of unauthorised ventilation outlet (amended design) – Approved October 1995

2/95/1169/F: Conversion of barn to form restaurant with link to public house to include ventilation stack over proposed store – Approved October 1995

2/94/1360/F and 2/94/1361/LB: Conversion of barn to form restaurant with link to public house – Approved October 1994

2/94/0327/LB: Extension and alterations and demolition of garage and timber store – Approved May 1994

2/94/0326/F: Extension and alterations - Approved May 1994

RESPONSE TO CONSULTATION

Parish Council: OBJECT to the proposed scheme. The objections to the original scheme related to the impact of the two-story extension which was considered the most damaging aspect of the proposed development, and would lead to substantial harm to the heritage asset.

The PC proposed an alternative scheme to provide managers accommodation in the roof space of the original building however the applicant did not consider that to be viable

The PCs object to the latest, amended scheme as follows:-

- The proposal does have an unnecessary negative impact on the core existing building, the original building's setting & to the amenity value of neighbouring properties. The following design changes can be made to enable us to withdraw our objection:

The mass & impact of the extension should be reduced by reducing eaves height of the two storey extension by approximately 300mm and reducing roof pitch to 30 degrees or less – bringing the ridge line down by about 1 metre.

A hip instead of gable end would also be more sympathetic.

- This approach could also be applied to the single story extension but our primary concern is the two storey extension.
- BTPC will withdraw its objection once satisfactory changes are made. We are keen that the pub reopens as soon as possible.

REPRESENTATIONS

Original scheme:-

4 objections received (from 3 people) referring to the following:-

- Damage to the historic building: the pub is a famous C17 listed building, with close associations with Lord Nelson, after whom it is named. The height of both the proposed 2 storey and single storey rear extensions seems excessive and out of keeping with the scale of the listed building.
- The new elevations are shown as being finished in brickwork, presumably on grounds of cost, and again would be out of keeping with the existing building when the rest of the building is clunch. The material should be changed to chalk/flint.
- It proposed extension directly impedes the view of the beautiful east facade of the GII listed barn adjacent to the pub at Ivy Farm, as well as damaging the setting both of that building and of the pub itself. The rear extension needs to be significantly reduced in height and redesigned so as to fit better with its historic surroundings.
- **Two neutral** comments referring to the following:
- Although I don't object to the application, I can't support it either, despite wishing to see the pub re-open as soon as possible.
- The first floor extension seems unnecessarily high and modern for a Grade II listed building and, with a bit of modification, it could fit in much better with the existing building and location.
- A realistic alternative plan is being drawn-up putting the extra staff accommodation rooms required into the large roof space of the main building. The existing bricked-up windows suggest that it has been used in the past.
- I fully support the re-opening of the pub and hope that the applicant can address any amendments to the plans as quickly as possible.

LDF CORE STRATEGY POLICIES

CS12 - Environmental Assets

SITE ALLOCATIONS AND DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT POLICIES PLAN 2016

DM15 – Environment, Design and Amenity

NATIONAL GUIDANCE

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)
 Planning Practice Guidance (PPG)

National Planning Policy Framework – sets out the Government's planning policies for England and how these are expected to be applied.

National Planning Practice Guidance - Provides National Planning Practice Guidance, in support of and in addition to the NPPF

PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

The only consideration in the determination of this application is the impact of the work on the significance of the listed building. The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) identifies protection and enhancement of the historic environment as an important element of sustainable development and establishes a presumption in favour of sustainable development in the planning system (paras. 6, 7 & 14).

It also states that the significance of designated heritage assets can be harmed or lost by alteration to them or development in their setting. As heritage assets are irreplaceable, any harm or loss should require clear and convincing justification (para. 132). Where a proposed development will lead to substantial harm to or total loss of significance of a designated heritage asset, LPAs should refuse consent, unless it can be demonstrated that the substantial harm or loss is necessary to achieve substantial public benefits that outweigh that harm or loss (para.133). Para.134 requires that where a proposal will lead to less than substantial harm this should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including securing its optimum viable use.

Furthermore, policy CS12 of the Core Strategy states that "The historic and built environment play a crucial role in delivering environmental quality and well-being. Therefore the Council will preserve and where appropriate enhance its qualities and characteristics.

Proposal

There has been a public house on this site since the 1800s and its connection to Lord Nelson is well documented. The building was last upgraded in 1995 but trade declined and it has been vacant for the last 12 months. This proposal would see it re-open as a public house and restaurant and whilst it is fair to say that there is widespread support for the proposal in principle the form and potential impact of the proposed extension has been the cause for some concern.

The original submission proposed a two storey extension and a further single storey extension to the rear of the existing listed building. However, during the course of the application and in response to concerns raised by statutory consultees, third parties, the Parish Council and your officers, the height of the roof has been reduced from the original proposal and the eaves sit well below those of the original building. It is proposed that the new extension be constructed in a mix of brick, render and horizontal timber weatherboarding rather than the brick, clunch and flint of the original building. This mix takes reference from the brick and painted front of the original building but will allow the extension to read as a modern addition. The roof will be of red clay pantiles which also accord with that which currently exists.

The Parish Council has no objection to the rear extension in principle but has maintained their objection to its height, stating that the eaves should be further reduced in height by an additional 300mm and the roof pitch should be dropped to 30 degrees which would bring the ridge line down by 1m. Additionally they consider this roof section should be hipped instead of a gable to be more sympathetic.

However, officers consider that dropping the eaves and changing the pitch would result in a rather broad and squat extension which would be out of proportion with the existing building and would therefore not relate well to it. Officers also feel unable to support the Parish Council's suggestion of a hipped roof. Whilst it is acknowledged that there are hipped roofs on other buildings in the village there are no hipped roofs on the existing listed building or on

outbuildings within the grounds of the public house. A hipped roof would therefore result in the introduction of alien feature within the site and one which would not sit comfortably with the existing building.

Internal changes to the historic structure are limited and are not considered to be such that they cause any harm to the significance of the building. The inside of the building is quite plain with little decorative detailing. However, there are two “Norfolk winder” style staircases leading from ground to first floor adjacent to the chimneys at each end of the original building. These are to be retained but closed off top and bottom to prevent regular use. The ground floor rooms of the original building will barely change but the first floor will be reconfigured to form improved living accommodation

Summary and conclusion.

In summary then, the proposal to upgrade and re-open the pub is welcomed. The designs of the extensions has been the subject of considerable debate but it is considered that the scheme as amended is appropriate in terms of design, scale and mass and therefore sits comfortably with the listed building and will cause less than substantial harm to its significance. It also requires relatively little loss of historic fabric in order to link the old and the new. Any harm which may be thought to be caused is substantially outweighed by the benefits provided in terms of keeping the building in ongoing and viable use for which it was originally intended, and which also allows public access, and the contribution the business makes to the local economy.

It is therefore recommend that listed building consent be granted.

RECOMMENDATION:

APPROVE subject to the imposition of the following condition(s):

- 1 Condition: This Listed Building Consent is granted subject to the condition that the works to which it relates shall be begun not later than the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.
- 1 Reason: To comply with Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act, 1990, as amended by Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act, 2004.
- 2 Condition: This Listed Building Consent relates only to works specifically shown on the approved plans detailed below. Any others works, the need for which becomes apparent, are not covered by this consent and details must be submitted to the Council as Local Planning Authority and approved before work continues.
 - Drawing No. 5596/401E, Site Plan as Proposed
 - Drawing No. 5596/402E, Floor Plans as Proposed
 - Drawing No. 5596/403E, Elevations as Proposed
 - Drawing No. 5596/404E, Elevations as Proposed
 - Drawing No. 5596/405D, Block Plan
 - Drawing No. 5596/407 Site Plan as Proposed
- 2 Reason: To ensure a satisfactory standard of works in the interests of safeguarding the Listed Building in accordance with the principles of the NPPF.

- 3 Condition: The brick/stone to be used for the external surfaces of the building hereby approved shall be constructed in accordance with a sample panel, prepared on site for the inspection and written approval of the Local Planning Authority. The sample panel shall measure at least 1 metre x 1 metre using the proposed materials, mortar type, bond, and pointing technique to be used in the approved scheme.
- 3 Reason: To ensure that the materials are in keeping with the Listed Building in accordance with the principles of the NPPF.
- 4 Condition: The brick bond, mortar mix and pointing techniques for the works hereby approved shall precisely match the existing details.
- 4 Reason: To ensure that such details are in keeping with the Listed Building in accordance with the principles of the NPPF.
- 5 Condition: All mortar, plaster and render to be used in the works to the existing historic structure hereby approved shall be lime rich and cement free to a specification to be agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development.
- 5 Reason: To ensure that such details are in keeping with the Listed Building in accordance with the principles of the NPPF.
- 6 Condition: 1:20 drawings of all new and/or replacement windows and glazed panels shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The plans shall provide for the use of timber windows, and shall include joinery details, cross-sections and the opening arrangements. The development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details.
- 6 Reason: To ensure that such details are in keeping with the Listed Building in accordance with the principles of the NPPF.
- 7 Condition: The existing clay pantiles must be carefully stripped from the roof as necessary and set aside for re-use on the existing historic structures. The balance to replace those unsuitable for re-use shall be made up with reclaimed clay pantiles to match those set aside. Samples of the clay pantiles to be used on the new development hereby approved shall be provided on site for the inspection and written approval of the Local Planning Authority.
- 7 Reason: To ensure that the materials are in keeping with the Listed Building in accordance with the principles of the NPPF.
- 8 Condition: Notwithstanding the approved plans, details of the following items at a scale of 1:20, or as otherwise specified, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of development:
- Drawings of all new or replacement joinery works involving windows, doors and staircase within the existing building
 - Drawings which provide siting, material and colour of all rainwater goods and statutory undertakers equipment to be installed.

- Drawings showing the precise location and details of any new vents, extractors, flues, cowls and air conditioning units to be installed in connection with the preparation and sale of food.
- The precise size, position and design of the proposed roof-lights.

The works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

- 8 Reason: To ensure that the works are properly controlled in the interests of safeguarding the Listed Building in accordance with the principles of the NPPF.